

Journal homepage: http://iieta.org/journals/ijsdp

Suitability of Green City Criteria (LEED) According to the Egyptian Special Environmental Characteristics

Rania Abdel Mohsen*, Pasent H.A. Yousef, Tarek Abou El Seoud



Department of Environmental Planning and Infrastructure, Faculty of Urban and Regional Planning, Cairo University, Giza 12613, Egypt

Corresponding Author Email: rania.mashhor@cu.edu.eg

https://doi.org/10.18280/ijsdp.170424	ABSTRACT
Received: 7 May 2022 Accepted: 15 July 2022	The research aims to suit the criteria for classifying green cities according to the characteristics of the Egyptian environmental zones to select the most relevant zone for sustainable green
Keywords: environmental zones, sustainable green cities, Egyptian cities, LEED criteria, suitability scoring system	cities. The Egyptian cities consume large quantities of materials, energy, and water causing different problems facing cities and their population. The criteria of sustainable green cities should be done according to the various characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt. The leadership in energy and environmental design (LEED) criteria for the Egyptian cities and communities' system is selected according to the characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt, aiming to select the most relevant zones to construct sustainable green cities. According to the ecological, geographical, economic, political, social, historical, urban, and cultural characteristics of environmental zones that are different from one zone to another in Egypt, the influencing factors in the classification criteria are introduced to show the incentives, capabilities, and challenges facing cities in making green and sustainable transformation by using weighted overlay model in Arc GIS. By using the suitability scoring system, the most suitable environmental zone, namely the dry coastal zone, has the motivation and ability to transform the city into a green and sustainable city according to its particular environmental characteristics.

1. INTRODUCTION

Egypt faces many problems and challenges in the fields of environmental, urban, economic, and social development because of having many negative impacts on the sustainability of Egyptian cities. These challenges occurred due to the overcrowded population in urban areas reaching 95% of the total population. In addition to the increase in Egyptian cities' consumption of materials, energy, and water, which reaches 60% of the total consumption, it causes depletion of resources, pollution of the environment, and an imbalance in the environment [1]. Thus, there is a decrease in the per capita share of water and energy, a spread of various wastes, and an increasing proportion of harmful emissions to 70% of the total emissions. The green urbanization forms more sustainable lifestyles, and reduces resources consumption, waste, and environmental footprint according to the three main pillars of green cities, which are zero fossil energy, zero waste, and zero harmful emissions [2].

All countries all over the world develop and implement policies, programs, and procedures that lead to the integration of the environmental dimensions in all developmental sectors to deal with challenges of global change and sustainability. Therefore, Egypt developed a strategy for sustainable development (Egypt Vision 2030) that aims to implement a system to maximize utilization and balance among energy, water, and land to make cities and human settlements safe and sustainable [3] through achieving green and socioeconomic sustainability, according to the UN Sustainable Development Goal 11 [4]. Therefore, the importance of green sustainable cities increases to be the only option to confront the threat of climate change and environmental challenges, and maintain the environmental balance in various planning stages of the city.

The city level has received major attention because the developers want to test the scalability of applying sustainability solutions, and measuring the effectiveness of reducing the impact of carbon emissions and the respect of green conditions by following the objectives and principles of green urbanization.

Based on the fact that there are differences among cities in their environmental impacts, per capita carbon, and their environmental footprint, there are various factors that have effects on converting cities into sustainable green ones. Taking these factors into account, which reflect the characteristics of environmental zones, will lead to minimize further negative challenges to Egyptian cities. So, the classification criteria for green sustainable cities must respect the characteristics of Egyptian environmental zones.

There are 59 urban sustainability rating tools in 22 countries all over the world, which are classified based on the geographic scale and special characteristics including cities, planned neighborhoods, existing neighborhoods, all neighborhoods, landscapes and parks, transportation and infrastructure, and special purposes [5]. The results of previous studies tackling the sustainability assessment tools at the city level, have found that "the recently developed LEED for cities and communities' tool performs better when compared to other tools" [6].

Therefore, the criteria for the classification of the LEED (CE) for green Cities and communities' tool have been selected in this paper to suit the characteristics of environmental Egyptian zones that differ from each other ecologically, geographically, economically, and socially. This paper selects the most suitable environmental Egyptian zone for converting the cities into green and sustainable ones.

2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research aims to present the relationship between the characteristics of environmental zones and the classification of sustainable green cities. The review of literature, previous studies and recent reports help select the criteria of classifying sustainable green cities according to the suitable classification system. These criteria are filtered according to the different characteristics of the environmental zones to show the degree of affecting factors by using weighted overlay model in Arc GIS program for comparing the (AF) on the selected criteria for classifying green cities, taking into account their relative weight. This is to determine the priority of these zones and select the most suitable one to convert cities into sustainable green ones by using suitability scoring system, as shown in Figure 1.



Figure 1. Methodological framework of the study

3. THE CHARACTERISTICS OF ENVIRONMENTAL ZONES IN EGYPT

The environmental zones refer to areas that are homogeneous in time, place and function in environmental characteristics. Egypt can be ecologically considered as three main zones: The coastal zone, the desert zone, and the river zone. They are divided into subzones that include the governorates and the natural determinants [7], as shown in Table 1 and (Figure 2). They have environmental characteristics that differ ecologically, geographically, economically, socially, and urban from each other. The coastal zones are divided into three zones. The rainy coastal zone extends along the northeastern and northwestern coasts of the Mediterranean Sea in Egypt. The dry coastal zone parallels the Red Sea coast from Halaveb and Shalateen to Suez governorate and its western borders are the Red Sea Mountains [8]. The special coastal zone extends along the South Sinai coast and has a special nature of water and wind movement [9]. The desert zones are divided into three zones. The aggressive eastern desert is a rugged and aggressive land. Although it is rich in mineral resources, it has highlands, depressions, rolling hills, and slopes that causes torrential besides difficulty in obtaining groundwater. The western desert zone is friendly as it is flat. It has Moghra aquifers, that form unique water resources for all human activities, contains freshwater [10], and has biodiversity in its oases [11]. In addition, the special Sinai desert zone has a special ecosystem [12]. The river zones extend around the river where the population density is high [13]. It is divided into the narrow river zone, south of Cairo in Upper Egypt, and the wide river area in the delta north of Cairo, which has flat and fertile land [12], and characterized by a number of northern lakes [14]. As a result of the diversity of environmental systems in these zones, the economic activities vary according to the geographical areas and the political system represented in laws, regulations, customs, and traditions. So, the functions, characteristics and culture of population are not the same, where the requirements of the Bedouin population are different from the coasts, Upper Egypt and the Delta zones. This variance directly affects the urban needs and consumption rates of the cities located in these environmental zones. Thus, it affects the criteria of constructing sustainable green cities.



Figure 2. The environmental zones in Egypt

The main zones	The subzones	The governorates included				
Coostal	Rainy coast	Alexandria – Matrouh – Port Said				
Coastal	Dry coast	Red Sea- Suez				
Zone	Special coast	Ismailia -South Sinai				
Descert	Eastern desert	Red Sea				
Desert	Western desert	El Wadi El Gadeed				
zone	Sinai desert	North and South Sinai				
River zone	Wide river (Nile Delta)	Cairo – Giza – Behera – Sharkia – Damietta - Kafr El Sheikh – Dakahlia – Gharbia – Qalyubia				
	Narrow river (Upper Egypt)	Menia – Souhage – Fayoum – Bani Sweif – Qena – Aswan – Assiut				

Table 1. The subzones of Egyptian environmental zones and the governorates included [7]

CLASSIFICATION OF 4. CRITERIA FOR SUSTAINABLE GREEN CITIES

There are many classification systems of sustainable green cities that have been developed at the city scale in different continents all over the world. The African Green City Index is a research project that seeks and assesses the measurements and environmental performance of major African cities across a range of criteria to understand the environmental challenges of these cities. Some Egyptian cities were evaluated according to such criteria, such as Cairo, Alexandria [15], New Damietta, 6th October, and Tenth of Ramadan [1], but these criteria, on which the evaluation was based, did not take into account the different characteristics of the environmental zones in Egypt like geographical, economical, and social characteristics, which contribute in facing the challenges facing sustainable green cities. Although there are large numbers of sustainability assessment tools, only few tools have been relatively used and adopted domestically and/or globally [6].

Recently, there are many previous studies comparing the tools for the classification of sustainable green cities and nominated the most suitable one according to the research purpose of each study. The results of these studies have shown that "the recently developed LEED tool for cities and communities performs better compared to other tools" [6], as it is characterized as a recent and comprehensive tool with multiple criteria related to the different characteristics that affect the classification of Egyptian green cities. It focuses on water and energy issues that Egypt suffers from, and gives them greater relative weights, so LEED criteria are aligned with the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals for sustainable green cities: Existing (LEED-CCE), have been selected for this research to be filtered according to the characteristics of coastal, river and desert environmental zones in Egypt through the different ecologically, geographically, economically, socially, and urban characteristics from one zone to another, therefore the criteria for classification of sustainable green cities will differ as well.

4.1 LEED for cities and communities (LEED-CCE)

LEED for Existing Cities and communities (LEED-CCE) is the most recent version of the LEED family to evaluate the sustainability and quality of life in a sustainable green city or community, as the USGBC has made efforts to align these versions with the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals, and emphasizes the climate change adaptation and mitigation for cities and communities of all shapes and sizes. At all phases of their evolution for measuring the performance of their social, economic and environmental conditions, LEED for cities and communities has several categories, which include the required credits and prerequisites. It contains two types: Base conditions and performance score [16].

4.2 Criteria for classification of LEED (CCE) for existing cities

LEED for cities and communities has several categories that include natural systems and ecology, transportation and land use, water efficiency, energy and greenhouse gas emissions, materials and resources, quality of life, innovation, and regional priority. The LEED (CCE) criteria for green city classification were selected according to their relationship to the different types of characteristics, as shown in Table 2.

Table 2. Filtration of LEED (CCE) criteria according to the characteristics of environmental zones in Egy	pt
---	----

	Categories	Code	Criteria for classification of LEED (CCE)	The characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt (Influencing factors)	Ch. Type	Weight	
INTE	GRATIVE PROCE	ESS					
sdit	Integrative	1	Comprehensive Plan	Comprehensive plan for green cities within the last five years according to a clear vision and strategy for the future.	an	1	
Cre	Leadership	2	Roadmap Development	Gap analysis for the city and setting roadmap goals related to details at the city level that are related to its characteristics	ogy- Urb	1	
Credit	Green Building Policy and Incentives	3	Green buildings registered or certified to LEED or equivalent,%	Factors affecting the increase in the percentage of green buildings registered or certified to LEED or ivalent,% Factors affecting the increase in the percentage of green buildings related to details at the city level that are related to its characteristics, function and developmental role			
NATU	IRAL SYSTEMS A	ND I	ECOLOGY				
		1	Topography: Unique topographic features and slope stability risks	Land covers characteristics that show unique topographic features and slope stability risks.	ter-		
equisite	Ecosystem	2 Soils: Unique farmland, healthy soils, and so disturbed by previous development		Soil characteristics that show the unique farmland, healthy & soil problem, and soil disturbed by previous development.	land-wa ation and abitat	R	
Prer	Assessment	3	Vegetation and Habitat: Total existing vegetated area and top three threatened species	Bioenvironmental characteristics that show the existing vegetation and habitats as well as threatens.	ology: Veget Ha		
		4	Hydrology and Aquatic Ecosystems	The characteristics of hydrology and aquatic ecosystem that show flood hazards, wetlands, lakes, streams,	Ecc		

	Categories	Code	Criteria for classification of LEED (CCE)	The characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt (Influencing factors)	Ch. Type	Weight
				shorelines, rainwater, water quality, watershed health, potable and non-potable water sources, and pollution sources.		
Credit	Green Spaces	5	Green space, square meters per person	Factors affecting the per capita share of green spaces: The population density, climate, soil fertility, topography, and water sources [17-21]	Ecology: (land- water-air) - Social	2
		6	Natural Resource Acreage, square meters per capita	Factors affecting the maintenance of natural resources acreage and their per capita share like threats resulted from human activities that affect the natural resources	ater-	
		7	Steep Slopes, not greater than 40%	Natural resources characteristic that show steep slopes, topographic and land features geotechnical evaluation and limits of development according to steep slopes	/: land-wa	
sdit	Natural Resources	8	Agricultural Land and Food Production	Factors affecting the disturbance of prime farmland, unique farmland, or farmland of statewide or local importance	-Ecology otic	2
Cre	Restoration	9	Vegetation and habitat	Factors affecting restoration of degraded vegetation and habitats plan if the site has any threatened or endangered species,	-political bic	2
			Aquatic Ecosystems, do not permit any development within a flood hazard area, within 61 m from normal high tide line, within 15 m of a wetland, within 30 m of a water body, which is greater than 50 acres, and within 15 meters for water bodies less than 50 acres	Aquatic Ecosystems characteristics that show the development limits within hazard areas and planning to protect against dangers [14, 22]	Geographical	
Credit	Light Pollution Reduction	11	Sky Glow Measurement: Achieve at or below 4 in the Bortle Dark-Sky and A minimum of 70% of the street lighting	The characteristics of Light Pollution that show sky glow measurement and affecting factors: The rapid urbanization expansion, economic growth, and misuse of available technologies [23].	Ecology: Energy- Urban	1
dit	Resilience	12	Vulnerability and Capacity Assessment	Vulnerability and Capacity Assessment for climate change hazards, natural and man-made hazards, and extreme events	ogy: Jrban	2
Cre	Planning	13	Resilience Plan	Adaptation and mitigation strategies that address the goals identified under Vulnerability and Capacity Assessment	Ecold risks-U	2
TRA	NSPORTATION AN	JD L	AND USE			
Prerequisite	Transportation Performance	1	Transportation performance score, vehicle miles traveled (VMT) per capita	Factors affecting vehicle miles traveled (VMT) per capita: Population density, employment by geographic unit, land-use mix like work-housing balance, city design, accessibility to the destination, and distance to transit [24], the unemployment rate, personal income, family size, and the availability of public transit [25].	Urban - Social	6
Credit	Compact, Mixed Use and Transit Oriented Development	2	Percentage of population residing within Compact and Complete Centers (Total of all CCCs), 40% minimum.	Factors affecting the percentage of population residing within Compact and Complete Centers (Total of all CCCs) relate to planning and design of the city that are related to its characteristics, function, and developmental role [26].	Urban	2
Credit	Access to Quality Transit	3	Quality of Transit Facilities: At least 80% of transit facilities safe and comfortable. <u>Intermodal Connectivity</u> : Connected to three or more modes of transportation. <u>Frequency of Trips</u> : Meeting the minimum requirement of 72 weekday trips and 30 weekend trips	Factors affecting the Quality of Transit Facilities (safe and comfortable), Intermodal Connectivity (traffic flow, and linkages between regional centers [27], increase non-motorized transportation, reduce the use of private cars, and more energy-efficient transportation [28], and Frequency of Trips (compact, mixed-use, and work places) [29].	Urban	1
it	Alternative Fred	4	Electric Vehicle Charging Facilities: (EVSE) in 2% of all public parking spaces or at least two spaces	Factors affecting the promoting and adopting	п	
Cred	Vehicles	5	Alternative Fuel Stations: A total of 12 stations meet or exceed 1.52 per 10,000 residents or comply with local or national equivalent	alternatives to fossil fuel vehicles: Electric Vehicle Charging Facilities and Alternative Fuel Stations [30].	Urba	2
Credit	Smart Mobility and Transportation Policy	6	Adopting any four solutions or policies to support smart and efficient transportation system.	Factors affecting the support of smart and efficient transportation systems like applying modern technology of a smart transportation system on roads and axes linking cities and logistic areas [31].	Urban- Political	2
Credit	High-Priority Site	7	Historic preservation for cities with at least one historic building, contributing building in a historic district, or designated cultural site that may be impacted by development	The characteristics of historic buildings and cultural sites to show the impact of development on the preservation of them [32, 33].	Historical -Cultural	2

	Categories	Code	Criteria for classification of LEED (CCE)	The characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt (Influencing factors)	Ch. Type	Weight
		8	High-Priority Sites and other locations, adopt policies to focus on development and growth	Affecting factors identify high-priority sites that include priority development areas, infill and/or previously developed sites or brownfield and/or greyfield sites to clean up and reuse.	Geographi cal- political- Urban	
WAT	ER EFFICIENCY					
		1	Water and Sanitation Access: 100% coverage of all buildings	Factors affecting Water and Sanitation Access: Geographical location, sources of water, infrastructure, and cost.	ocial- l	
te		2	Drinking Water Quality: The annual average concentration of dissolved oxygen (DO) is not less than 6 mg/L [34].	Drinking water characteristics that show factors affecting the quality of drinking water and the extent to which water treatment facilities comply with the adopted drinking water quality standard	conomic-S eographica	
Prerequisi	Water Access and Quality	3	Treated Wastewater Quality: 100% of wastewater treatment systems must comply with the permit program of the Clean Water Act	Factors affecting treated wastewater quality and to what extent they comply with the adopted wastewater treatment and quality standards: The annual average concentration of organic matter (BOD) is not more than 6 mg/L) [34, 35].	water-Urban-E ıral-political-G	R
		4	Storm water Quality: Adopting a policy for storm water pollution prevention	Factors affecting Stormwater quality that show to what extent they comply with National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System for stormwater pollution prevention from construction and industrial activities and municipal sources [36, 37].	Ecology: cultu	
Prerequisite	Water Performance	5	Water performance score: A minimum of 40	Factors affecting less per capita domestic water consumption: Climatic conditions, availability of alternative water sources and quality, culture and people's habits, water cost, socio-economic status and the total population [38, 39].	ology: water- an-Economic- cial-cultural-	6
Credit	Integrated Water Management	6	The ratio of water withdrawals for human use to the total freshwater resources is less than 0.2	The characteristics have been included in Factors affecting the prerequisite of Water Efficiency category	Ec Urb So	1
edit	Storm water	7	Reported flooding incidences in the past five years	The characteristics have been included in factors	logy: tter	2
Cr	Management	8	Green Storm water Infrastructure: 35% of the land area has designated green storm water infrastructure	Ecology, and Water Efficiency, categories. Some influencing factors re related to details at the city level that are related to its characteristics function and	Ecol wa	L
Credit	Smart Water Systems	9	Water Audit and Automation: At least Water Audit	developmental role	Urban	2
ENE	RGY AND GREENH	IOU	SE GAS EMISSIONS			
		1	Electricity Access: 100% coverage of households or population by electricity service	Various characteristics and factors that affect the access of electricity: Geographical location, energy sources, infrastructure, and cost [40].	al-	
Prerequisite	Power Access, Reliability and Resiliency	2	Reliability Performance Monitoring	Factors affecting continuous monitoring (automatic or manual) and recording of interruptions for the complete distribution network at high, medium, and low voltage levels and the possibility of providing smart networks that are affected by renewable energy resources, Smart Transmission, Smart Distribution (Utilization), Pumping and storage stations, Natural disasters, and Backup power [41, 42].	conomic- social- cultur ical-	R
		3	Power Surety and Resiliency	Factors that affect the supply of backup power for critical cities loads or emergency services and basic services during outages or widespread disasters, and also affect the providing of smart networks [43].	ergy- Urban- E polit	
Credit	Energy and GHG Emissions Performance	4	Energy and Greenhouse Gas (GHG) Performance Score: A minimum of 40	Factors affecting Greenhouse Gas emissions (CO ₂ equivalent): The annual energy consumption from all sectors (the electricity- transportation- manufacturing-construction- emissions from oil and natural gas), the source of energy, emissions co-efficient for electricity and all fuel types, the total population [16].	Ecology: en	14
		5	Street Lighting and Public Area Lighting: A minimum of 70% of the street lighting		Urban	
Credit	Energy Efficiency 6		Water and Wastewater: Meeting energy conservation standards for Pumps for 50% minimum of the pumps used in water supply, drainage, and wastewater treatment	The influencing factors related to details at the level of the city that are related to its characteristics, function and developmental role	Ecology: Water-Energy- Air	4

	Categories	Code	Criteria for classification of LEED (CCE)	The characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt (Influencing factors)	Ch. Type	Weight
		7	% District Energy supplied by DES: 80% minimum			
		8	New Off-Site Renewables: 20% minimum			
edit	Renewable Energy	10	Existing Off Site Renewables: 60% minimum			6
Ċ	Itelie wable Energy	11	Green-e Certified RECs and Carbon Offsets: 100%	Some influencing factors have been included in the prerequisite of Energy and Greenhouse Gas Emission		0
		12	150%	category. Some influencing factors are related to details		
Credit	Low Carbon Economy	13	Reduction in Greenhouse Gas (GHG) emissions intensity of the economy over a period of three consecutive years	Ecology- Economic	4	
Credit	Grid Harmonization	14	Load Management (access to dynamic pricing), Demand Response (tariff options), Net Metering and Interconnection Policy	The influencing factors related to details at the level of the city that are related to its characteristics, function and developmental role. Some influencing factors have been included in the prerequisite of Energy and Greenhouse Gas Emission category.	Urban	2
MAT	TERIALS AND RES	OUR	RCES			
0		1	Access waste Management Services: 100%	Various characteristics and factors affecting the access of waste management services	cal-	
Prerequisite	Solid Waste Management	2	Solid Waste Management Plan, Support waste management and diversion strategies	Factors affecting the Solid waste management plan include segregation, waste storage and collection, waste handling processing facility, and material recovery facility in accordance with local or national regulations [44, 45].	Ecology-Politi Economic	R
Prerequisite	Waste Performance	3	Waste performance score: A minimum of 40	Factors affecting rates of resource consumption and efficiency usage (waste generated and diverted), municipal solid waste generated and diverted from landfill (% of the total amount collected): The population growth, waste generation and recycling, and environmental awareness [45, 46].	Ecology- Cultural	4
Credit	Special Waste Streams Management	4	Waste generated through special waste streams (in metric tons per year) and waste diverted (percentage diverted)	prerequisite of the materials and resources category and are related to the city's function and developmental role		1
Credit	Responsible Sourcing for Infrastructure	5	Purchase 20% minimum by cost of permanently installed in top three infrastructure materials		Urban	2
redit	Material Recovery	6	Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR) policy: A minimum of 10% of the total annual waste generated	The influencing factors related to details at the level of	conomic-	1
J		7 Audit for all non-recyclable waste generated within the city		population size, and developmental role. Some influencing factors have been included in the	ology- E	
dit	Smart Waste	8	 'neumatic Transport Systems: Loading Stations, 'ransport Network, Waste Handling and 'rocessing Facility 		Ec	2
Cré	Systems	agement 9 Smart Bins and Route Optimization				2
	-	10	% of waste handled by smart waste management			
QUA	LITY OF LIFE		systems. 2070 minimum			
Prere.	Demographic Assessment	1	Comprehensive demographic narrative describing all of the population and housing characteristics	The urban, social, and economic characteristics that include the characteristics of population and housing.	-Social - nomic	R
Prere	Quality of Life Performance	2	Quality of Life Performance score: A minimum of 40	Factors affecting the quality of life performance in cities: Education, equitability, prosperity, health and safety [13, 47].	Urban Eco	6
		3	Population with a High School Degree: Equal to or	The characteristics included in factors affecting the		
		4	Graduation Rate: Equal to or greater than 90%.	influencing factors relate to details at the city level that		
		5 Small Businesses: Equal to or greater than 20. are related to		are related to its characteristics, function, population		
lit	Trend	6	Unemployment Rate: between 3 to 4 percent size, and developmental role. Poverty Rate: Declining at a rate of zero poverty by		al	
Cret	Improvements	7	2025.			4
		8	Percentage of household incomes meeting the			
			Violent Crime: Equal to or less than 5.5 homicides, 70 incidents of forcible rape, and 462.7 aggravated assaults.			

	Categories	Code	Criteria for classification of LEED (CCE)	The characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt (Influencing factors)	Ch. Type	Weight
redit	Trend	10	Asthma rate and Hypertension: none, trend decreasing only	_	ocial	4
Ü	Improvements	11	Obesity rate: equal to or less than 26%		S	
		12	Equitable Per Capita Income	<u>.</u>		
edit	Distributional	13	Equitable Workforce Mobility, Graduation Rate Equity	_	omic- ban	4
Ċ	Equity	14	Equitable Employment		Con	т
		15	Walking Distance Requirement: (400 meters) minimum.	<u>.</u>	Ē	
Cred.	Environmental Justice	16	Reducing the risks and exposure to priority environmental justice conditions for priority areas in the last 5 years.		litical- nic	1
		17	Comprehensive Housing Policy	- The characteristics included in factors affecting the	gy-Po	
Credit	Housing and Transportation Affordability 18		Housing and Transportation Costs: At least 60% of households, compared to the National Typical household, would spend less than 45% on housing and transportation combined.	prerequisite of the Quality of Life category. Some influencing factors relate to details at the city level that are related to its characteristics, function, population size, and developmental role	Ecolog Ec	2
		19	Diversity in Appointment to Local Advisory Board			
lit	Civic and	20	Conduct Survey on Community Impact: At least 51% or more of residents			
Crec	Community Engagement		Conducting Survey on Neighborhood Cohesion: At least 80% of residents		_	2
		22	Volunteering by Residents: At least 30% of residents		olitica	
		23	Adopting a policy-based mission statement to promote a discrimination free quality of life for all		ial- Po	
dit	Civil and Human	24	Initiatives and policies that ensure the voting rights of all eligible voters.		Soc	1
Cre	Rights	25	Integrating community policing and procedural justice	-		I
		26	Having in place a local officer or Commission on Human Rights	-		
INN	OVATION					
	T	1	Innovation: Using a strategy not addressed in the LEED for Cities and communities rating system	The influencing factors related to details at the city level that are related to its characteristics, and there are		ć
	Innovation	2	Exemplary Performance	no factors affecting these criteria that give priority to		6
		3	GBCI Rating Systems	one environmental zone over another		
REG	SIONAL PRIORITY					
Cred.	Regional Priority	1	Regional Priority	The different characteristics that address geographic specific socio-economic and environmental priorities [48-50].	All	4
•	The difference in char	acter	istics of the environmental zones in Egypt and their ef	fect the criteria for classifying green cities:		
	Affec	ung	Ine criteria Not affecting the cri	teria or repetitive		

5. FILTRATION OF LEED (CCE) **CRITERIA** ACCORDING TO THE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE ENVIRONMENTAL ZONES IN EGYPT

The difference in the characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt is reflected in the affecting factors on the classification criteria for Egyptian sustainable green cities. So, the filtration of these criteria, according to these characteristics, relates to the sustainability of these zones, and the incentives and capabilities to convert cities into sustainable green ones. Table 2 shows the criteria affected by the characteristics of the environmental zones that give priority to one environmental zone over another. It also shows the non-affected criteria that include repetitive characteristics in other previous criteria. It depends on actions for the efficiency of cities, that are related to the characteristics of these cities, their population, development role, and functions.

6. THE CHARACTERISTICS AFFECTING THE SELECTED Criteria FOR CLASSIFYING GREEN CITIES IN THE ENVIRONMENTAL ZONES IN EGYPT BY USING GIS PROGRAM

After filtration, the selected criteria for classifying green cities were applied on environmental zones in Egypt in details according to their characteristics that reflect the factors affecting the criteria by scoring these factors in every zone, using the (weighted sum) tool (ArcMap version 10.3) program from the (spatial analyst tools) list and selecting the (overlay) tools, setting the values deduced from the factors affecting each of the criteria of each category, as shown in Eq. (1), and selecting the appropriate field for it to make a reclassification of each weight for ease of assembly. They deduce the classifications for the Egyptian environmental zones, as shown in Figures 3-9.

Degree of AFn = score of AFn * Wn(Weight of the criteria n)(1) $Example: AFb = \sum AFb1*W1 + AFb2*W2 + AFb3*W3 + ...AFbn*Wn$



Figure 3. Natural systems and ecology in Egypt, Afb



Figure 4. Transportation and land use in Egypt, Afc



Figure 5. Water efficiency in Egypt, AFd



Figure 6. Energy and greenhouse gas emissions in Egypt, Afe



Figure 7. Materials and resources in Egypt, Aff



Figure 8. Quality of life in Egypt, AFg



Figure 9. Integrative process and Regional priority in Egypt



Figure 10. Total AF in the environmental zones in Egypt

Deducing the total AF of the Egyptian environmental regions by aggregating the coefficients of the previous classifications individually, and classifying them according to the coefficients of spatial pixels by a tool (weighted overlay) through putting the coefficients of values in the table of the tool and the ratios calculations for each study through the (ARC program) MAP version 10.3). The values are put according to the ratings (high – medium - low) for easing the general classification, as shown in Eq. (2), and Figure 10.

7. SUITABILITY SCORING SYSTEM FOR THE ENVIRONMENTAL ZONES IN EGYPT ACCORDING TO THEIR IMPACT DEGREE ON CRITERIA FOR CLASSIFYING GREEN CITIES

Using suitability scoring system for sustainable green cities according to the characteristics of environmental zones in Egypt is done to arrange these environmental zones according to the priority to habilitate the sustainable green cities in accordance with the selected criteria for classification. Their weight leads to select the most suitable environmental zone, which is the dry coastal zone because of having the incentives and capabilities to turn cities into sustainable green ones, as shown in Table 3, Figures 11 and 12. The value of suitability scoring for Egyptian environmental zones can be calculated by:

Suitability scoring for the environmental

$$zone = \sum_{\substack{\text{Score of acheving criteria} \\ *W(weight of criteria)}} (3)$$

Figure 11 shows that the criteria for classifying green cities in the category of energy and greenhouse gas emission are affected by the characteristics of the environmental zones in Egypt, followed by criteria of natural system and ecology, and the criteria of water efficiency. The dry coastal zone is the most priority environmental zone for habilitating sustainable green cities as it has factors that help increase the chances of achieving green city criteria, as shown in Figure 13; the Western desert zone, the Upper Egypt zone, the Rainy coastal zone, the Special coastal zone, the Eastern desert zone, the Delta zone, and finally the Sinai desert zone, as shown in Figure 12.

				The er	nvironme <u>nta</u>	al zones i <u>n E</u>	gypt			
Categories		Coastal zone			Desert zone			River zone		Woight
		Rainy	Dry	Special	Eastern	Western	Sinai	Delta	Upper Egypt	weight
			INTE	GRATIVE	PROCESS					
Integrative Planning and Leadership	1	1	1	1	0.5	1	1	0.5	0	1
		NAT	URAL S	SYSTEMS .	AND ECOL	JOGY				
	1	1	1	0	0	1	0.5	1	1	
Ecosystem Assessment	2	0.5	0	0.5	0	1	0.5	1	1	0
Ecosystem Assessment	3	1	1	0.5	0.5	1	1	1	1	9
·	4	0.5	0.5	0.5	0	1	0.5	0	0.5	-
Green Spaces	5	0.5	0	1	0	0.5	0	0	0	2
	6	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Natural Pasauraas	7	1	1	0	0.5	1	1	1	1	_
Indural Resources	8	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1	2
Conservation and Restoration	9	1	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	-
	10	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	1	-
Light Pollution Reduction	11	0.5	0.5	1	1	1	1	0	0	1
Resilience Planning	12	0.5	0	0	0.5	0.5	0	0.5	0	2

 Table 3. Suitability scoring system for the environmental zones in Egypt according to the selected criteria for the classification of LEED (CCE) for existing cities

				The en	vironmenta	l zones in E	gypt			
Catagorias	de	C	'oastal zo	one	D	esert zone	Rive	r zone	Weish4	
Categories	C	Rainy	Dry	Special	Eastern	Western	Sinai	Delta	Upper Egypt	weight
	13	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	2
		TRA	ANSPOR	RTATION A	AND LAND	USE				
Transportation Performance	1	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0	6
Access to Quality Transit	3	0.5	0.5	0.5	0	0	0.5	0	0	1
Altornativo Fuol Vohiclos	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.5	0	2
Alternative Fuer Venicles	5	0.5	0	0	0	0	0	0.5	0	4
Smart Mobility and Transportation Policy	6	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0	2
	7	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.5	0.5	2
Hign-Priority Site	8	1	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0	0	- 2
			WA	TER EFFIC	CIENCY					
	1	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	1	1	
Water Access and Quality	2	0.5	1	1	0	0.5	0	0.5	0.5	- 11
water Access and Quanty	3	0.5	1	1	0.5	0.5	1	0.5	0.5	- 11
-	4	0	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	-
Water Performance	5	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	6
		ENERGY	AND G	REENHOU	USE GAS EI	MISSIONS				
Dowor Accord Deliability and	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	_
Power Access, Kenability and Desilionary	2	0.5	1	0	0.5	0.5	0	0.5	1	30
Kesmency	3	0.5	1	0	0.5	1	0	0.5	1	-
Energy and Greenhouse Gas Emissions Performance	4	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	14
		Ν	IATERI	ALS AND	RESOURCI	ES				
	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0.5	0	10
Solid Waste Management	2	0.5	0.5	0	0	0	0	0.5	0.5	10
	3	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0.5	0	0.5	4
			QU	UALITY OI	F LIFE					
Demographic Assessment	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	20
Quality of Life Performance	2	0	0.5	1	0	0	0	0	0	6
			REG	IONAL PR	IORITY					
Regional Priority	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	4
Total		158	214	143	139	193	133	138	164	
Arrange of priority		4	1	5	6	2	8	7	3	





120



100 80 60 40 20 0 ENERGY AND REENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS TRANSPORTATION AND LAND USE WATER EFFICIENCY INTEGRATIVE PROCESS MATERIALS AND QUALITY OF LIFE NATURAL SYSTEMS AND ECOLOGY REGIONAL PRIORITY RESOURCES Dry coastal zone scoring Target scoring

Figure 12. The priority of the environmental zones in Egypt according to their characteristics for habilitating the sustainable green cities



8. CONCLUSION

While the characteristics of the environmental zones reflect the affecting factors, they affect the criteria for classifying sustainable green cities. If these factors vary from one zone to another, the ability of the cities to be green differs accordingly. The zone that has the potential and opportunities to achieve these criteria should be given the priority because it has the ability to face the problems and challenges that prevent their achievement. The research shows the criteria of classifying green cities' filtration by selecting the criteria that distinguish the environmental zones according to theirs characteristics. It does not select the criteria that are related to the details of city level and its characteristics. Therefore, the research recommends future research to investigate the relationship between the Egyptian cities' characteristics and the criteria of classifying green cities. This will help clarify that these criteria are affected by the city's function, population size, and the developmental role aiming to convert the cities in the same environmental zone into sustainable green ones. The research has compared the affecting factors on the selected criteria for classifying green cities in the Egyptian environmental zones by using the weighted overlay model in the Arc GIS program. The suitability scoring system is used to arrange the priority of these environmental zones, resulting in the dry coastal zone being the most priority environmental zone in Egypt for converting cities into sustainable green ones because it has the characteristics and factors that increase the chances of achieving green city criteria, especially the energy and greenhouse gas emissions criteria.

REFERENCES

- Hegazy, I., Seddik, W., Ibrahim, H. (2017). Towards green cities in developing countries: Egyptian new cities as a case study. International Journal of Low-Carbon Technologies, 12(4): 358-368. http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/ijlct/ctx009
- [2] Lehmann, S. (2011). Climate Change Research and Technology for Adaptation and Mitigation, chapter 14: What is Green Urbanism? Holistic Principles to Transform Cities for Sustainability. ResearchGate. http://dx.doi.org/10.5772/23957
- [3] Team, P. (2018). Sustainable Dev elopment Goals Report: Egypt 2030. Fredericks. Pardee Center For International Futures, University of Denver.
- [4] Assembly, G. (2017). Work of the Statistical Commission pertainingto the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. United Nations, General Assembly. https://worldtop20.org/globalmovement?gclid=EAIaIQobChMIoo3Ewr2F-QIVj-5RCh14OwDxEAAYAiAAEgKFs_D_BwE.
- [5] Planners, C. (2014). A global survey of urban sustainability rating tools. http://crit.com/wpcontent/uploads/2014/11/criterion_planners_sustainabili ty_ratings_tool.pdf.
- [6] Milovidova, A., Sharifi, A., Kawakubo, S. (2020). Chapter 11: Urban sustainability assessment tools: Toward integrating smart city indicators. Urban Systems Design, pp. 345-372. https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-816055-8.00011-7
- [7] Haggag, M.R., Hesham, P. (2019). Productive low cost environmentally friendly village. PLEV National

Project, Environmentally friendly – Low cost Sanitation techniques. Ministry of Research, Science & Technology Development Fund (STDF).

- [8] Abd El-Ghani, M., Salama, F., Abdel Aleem, M. (2014). Flora and Vegetation of the Eastern Desert of Egypt. Lambert Academic Publisher.
- [9] GFDRR. (2020). Arab Republic of Egypt. https://thinkhazard.org/en/report/40765-arab-republicof-egypt, accessed on July 5, 2021.
- [10] MWRI. (2005). National Water Resources Plan 2017, NWRP project. Minisitry of Water Resources and Irrigation, Planning Sector. http://extwprlegs1.fao.org/docs/pdf/egy147082.pdf, accessed on Mar. 6, 2022.
- [11] Center, D.R. (2013). Sustainable management of natural resources for combating land degradation and conservation of biodiversity in the oases of western desert, Egypt, project. IPBES, Intergovernmental Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services, Science and Policy for People and Nature.
- [12] El-Ramady, H., Alshaal, T., El-Henawy, A.S., Shams, M.S. (2019). The Soils of Egypt. Springer International Publishing. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95516-2
- [13] Hegazy, I.R. (2021). The quality of life between theory and implementation in Egypt: The case of Al-Rehab City, Egypt. Ain Shams Engineering Journal, 12(2): 2285-2296. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asej.2020.09.010
- [14] Negm, A., Bek, M., Abdel-Fattah, S. (2019). Egyptian Coastal Lakes and Wetlands: Part I Characteristics and Hydrodynamics. Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2019. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-93590-4
- [15] Denig, S. (2011). African Green City Index, Assessing the environmental performance of Africa's major cities. Siemens AG. https://digital.zlb.de/viewer/metadata/15502824/1/.
- [16] USGBC. (2021). LEED v4.1 Cities And Communities: Existing. U.S. Green Building Council. https://www.usgbc.org/leed/v41#cities-andcommunities, accessed on Mar. 6, 2022.
- [17] Agency, E.A. (2008). Environmental characterization of the Red Sea Governorate. The Ministry of Environment. https://www.eeaa.gov.eg/enus/mediacenter/reports/govenvprof.aspx.
- [18] Hereher, M., El-Ezaby, K. (2012). Soil and water quality assessment along the Red Sea coast, Egypt. International Journal of Environmental Studies, 69(1): 65-77. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00207233.2011.641241
- [19] Prospects, W.U. (2021). Alexandria Population 2021, Other Cities in Egypt. Retrieved July 10, 2021, from World Population Review. https://worldpopulationreview.com/worldcities/alexandria-population.
- [20] Authority, E.S. (2021). Egypt in Figures 2021. Central Agency for Public Mobilization and Statistics. https://www.arabdevelopmentportal.com/publication/eg ypt-figures-environment-2021.
- [21] Keleg, M. (2018). Review of green spaces provision approaches in Cairo, Egypt. Research Student Conference 2018 - Faculty of Technology, Design and Environment At: Oxford Brookes University. https://radar.brookes.ac.uk/radar/items/c7b7409e-f799-45ff-8de2-5b2280801433/1/.
- [22] Agency, E.A. (2006). National plan to confront

environmental disasters. Environmental Affairs Agency, the Arab Republic of Egypt. https://www.eeaa.gov.eg/en-

us/topics/general/crises/emergencyplans.aspx.

- [23] Kamel, S., Sabry, H., Hassan, G., et al. (2020). Architecture and Urbanism: A Smart Outlook, chapter: Visual Pollution: An Approach to Reduce the Environmental Impact of Light Pollution in Egypt. Proceedings of the 3rd International Conference on Architecture and Urban Planning, Cairo, Egypt: Springer Nature Switzerland AG. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-52584-2
- [24] Council, N.R. (2009). Chapter: 3 Impacts of Land use patterns on vehicle miles traveled: Evidence from the literature. Driving and the Built Environment: The Effects of Compact Development on Motorized Travel, Energy Use, and CO₂ Emissions -- Special Report 298, National Academy of Sciences.
- [25] Hymel, K.M. (2014). Factors influencing vehicle miles traveled in California: Measurement and analysis. California State University, Northridge. https://sor.senate.ca.gov/sites/sor.senate.ca.gov/files/cto ols/CCS_Report--Exaters_Influencing_Vahials_Miles_Traveled_in_Calif.

Factors_Influencing_Vehicle_Miles_Traveled_in_Calif ornia.pdf.

- [26] Tiemeier, V. (2019). Developing a national urban policy for Egypt: Towards compact cities. Alternative Policy Solutions, public policy research project at the American University in Cairo. https://aps.aucegypt.edu/en/articles/85/developing-anational-urban-policy-for-egypt-towards-compactcities.
- [27] (JICA), J. (2008). The Study on Multimodal Transport and Logistics System the Eastern Mediterranean Region and Master Plan in the Arab Republic of Egypt, Chapter 4. Transport Planning Authority, Ministry of Transport, the Arab Republic of Egypt. https://openjicareport.jica.go.jp/pdf/11893450_01.pdf.
- [28] Wong, R. (2013). United Nations Development Programme, Evaluation of UNDP/GEF Project: Egypt Sustainable Transport. Egyptian Environmental Affairs Agency.

https://erc.undp.org/evaluation/documents/detail/6654.

- [29] Youssef, M., Lila, A. (2014). Transit Oriented Development (TOD) as aholistic appraoch for future urbanism in Egypt. Conference: 10th International conference "Role of Engineering Towards a Better Environment". Alexandria, Egypt: researchgate. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/291830455.
- [30] Energy, M.O. (2019). Electric vehicles in Egypt opportunities and challenges. Strategic Business Advisors. http://www.lynxegypt.com/assets/pdfs/IndustryNotes1-2019.pdf.
- [31] Staff, E.T. (2020). Egyptian president urges quick implementation of smart transportation system. Retrieved Sep. 1, 2021, from Egypt Today. https://www.egypttoday.com/Article.
- [32] El-Saeed, Y. (2013). A call to protect Egypt's monuments and heritage. Save Egypt's heritage for its future. https://dailynewsegypt.com/2013/09/24/a-call-to-protect-egypts-monuments-and-heritage/.
- [33] Coordination, T.N. (2010). The foundations and criteria for urban coordination of open areas and green spaces.

The National Organization for Civilization Coordination approved by the Supreme Council for Planning and Urban Development According to Law No. 119 of 2008 and Its Executive Regulations. http://www.urbanharmony.org/guide/mosthat% 20khdra a.pdf.

- [34] Mostafa, S. (2017). State of the Environment Report 2016 Arab Republic of Egypt. Egyptian Ministry of Environment. https://www.eeaa.gov.eg/portals/0/eeaaReports/SoE-2017/Egypt%20SOE%202017%20-%20SPM%20Englis h.pdf.
- [35] Saber, M., Es, H., Abouziena, H., Haggag, W., El-Ashry, S., Zaghloul, A. (2016). Management of sewage farming in Arid Region: Egyptian experience. International Scientific Researches Journal, 72(3). http://dx.doi.org/10.21506/j.ponte.2016.3.7
- [36] Gado, T., El-Agha, D. (2020). Feasibility of rainwater harvesting for sustainable water management in urban areas of Egypt. Environmental Science and Pollution Research, 27: 32304-32317. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s11356-019-06529-5
- [37] Helally, H. (2018). Towards Egyptian Stormwater Pollution Prevention. Linkedin. https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/towards-egyptianstormwater-pollution-prevention-helalley-helalley.
- [38] Goal, E. (2019). Per Capita Demand and factors affecting per capita demand. Retrieved October 5, 2021, from Engineering Goal: https://www.engineeringoal.com/2019/07/per-capitademand.html.
- [39] Lema, N., Sabaya, W., Kaseva, M. (2020). Chapter Four: Water demand assessment. In Design, Construction Supervision, Operation and Maintenance (DCOM) Manual Fourth Edition. Mkuki na Nyota Publishers Ltd. https://www.maji.go.tz/uploads/publications/sw164015 9401-

28.%20Design,%20Construction%20Supervision,%20O &M%20of%20Water%20Projects%20Manual%20Vol. %20IV.pdf.

- [40] Mourad, M., Abdel-Rahman, A., Ali, A.H. (2013). Renewable Energy Technologies Utilization in Egyptian Desert Cities. The Seventh Annual Conference of Futuristic Studies At: Assiut, Egypt. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/283349110.
- [41] Abou-Ghazala, A., El-Shennawy, T. (2012). Applying the smart grid concept in Egypt: challenges and opportunities. 15th Middlle East Power System Conference (MEPCON 2012), Project: Smart Grid. 15th Middlle East Power System Conference. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/235784014.
- [42] Hasan, S., Al-Aqeel, T., El Salmawy, H. (2020). Electricity sectoreatures liberalization in Egypt: Features, challenges and opportunities for market integration. The King Abdullah Petroleum Studies and Research Center (KAPSARC). https://www.kapsarc.org/research/publications/electricit y-sector-liberalization-in-egypt-features-challengesand-opportunities-for-market-integration/.
- [43] Enterprise. (2020). With a surplus of electricity, why do we still get power cuts? Retrieved Novmber 10, 2021, from Enterprise: https://enterprise.press/hardhats/surplus-electricity-stillget-power-cuts/.

- [44] GIZ. (2019). Improving waste management in Egypt, National Solid Waste Management Programme (NSWMP). Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH: https://www.giz.de/en/worldwide/22230.html, accessed on Nov. 5, 2021.
- [45] Ibrahim, M., Mohamed, N.A. (2016). Towards Sustainable Management of Solid Waste in Egypt. Procedia Environmental Sciences, 34: 336-347. http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.proenv.2016.04.030
- [46] Milik, S.M. (2021). Assessment of solid waste management in Egypt during the last decade in light of the partnership between the Egyptian government and the private sector. AUC Knowledge Fountain. https://fount.aucegypt.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3 470&context=retro etds.
- [47] Hassan, D. (2019). Quality of life to achieve new Egyptian cities. Conference: Proceedings of the first international conference Environmental Efficiency For Human Well Being (EBQL) At: J W Marriott Hotel Cairo, Egypt. ResearchGate. http://dx.doi.org/10.21625/archive.v3i3
- [48] El-Din, R.G. (2021). Egypt's Water Security Situation in the Context of Asia Water Development Outlook Approach. Journal of Al-Azhar University Engineering Sector. http://dx.doi.org/10.21608/auej.2021.166632
- [49] Youssef, A. (2017). The national strategic plan for urban development - vision 2052, and the UN sustainable development Goals – SDGs, investigating features of alignment. United Nations Development Programme,

ResearchGate.

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/338737900.

[50] Planning, G.O. (2014). The national urban development framework in the Arab Republic of Egypt. Ministry of Housing and utilities urban communities. http://gopp.gov.eg/wp-content/uploads/2014/09/.pdf.

NOMENCLATURE

BOD	Biochemical Oxygen Demand
DES	Distributed Energy Systems
RECs	Renewable Energy Certificates
GBCI	Green Building Certification Institute

- AF Affecting Factors the criteria of classification for green cities in the environmental zones in Egypt
- AFa Affecting Factors the criteria of Integrative process
- AFb Affecting Factors the criteria of Natural systems and ecology
- AFc Affecting Factors the criteria of Transportation and land use
- AFd Affecting Factors the criteria of Water efficiency
- AFe Affecting Factors the criteria of Energy and greenhouse gas emissions
- AFf Affecting Factors the criteria of Materials and resources
- AFg Affecting Factors the criteria of Quality of life
- AFh Affecting Factors the criteria of Regional priority W Weight of the criteria of classification for green
- W Weight of the criteria of classification for green cities